AGR: 5/3/5 Vol. VIII

January 14, 2025

The Honourable Brigid Mary Annisette-George

Speaker of the House Speaker's Chambers Office of the Parliament Parliamentary Complex The Red House St. Vincent Street Port of Spain

Dear Honourable Speaker of the House,

The Nineteenth Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Examination of the Reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements of the Agricultural Development Bank (ADB) for the financial years 2014 to 2018

Reference is made to your correspondence Parl: 5/2/132 dated November 20, 2024 with subject at caption.

Please find the response of the Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries to the recommendations contained in the Report at **Appendix**.

Submitted for your consideration, please.

Yours sincerely,

Ms. Nela Dwarika-Ali

Permanent Secretary (Ag.)

no DIN.



Government of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago

Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries

OFFICE OF THE MINISTER Senator the Honourable Haji Kazim Hosein

AGR: 5/3/5 Vol. VIII

14th January, 2025

The Honourable Brigid Mary Annisette-George Speaker of the House Speaker's Chambers Office of the Parliament Parliamentary Complex The Red House St. Vincent Street PORT OF SPAIN

Dear Speaker of the House,

The Nineteenth Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Examination of the Reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements of the Agricultural Development Bank (ADB) for the financial years 2014 to 2018

Reference is made to your correspondence Parl: 5/2/132 dated 20th November, 2024 with subject at caption.

Please find the response of the Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries to the recommendations contained in the Report at **Appendix**.

Submitted for your consideration, please.

Yours sincerely,

Haji Kazim Hosein MINISTER

OF AGRICULTURE, LAND & FISHERIES | Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries

Corner Narsaloo Ramaya Marg Road & Soogrim Trace, Chaguanas, Trinidad, W.I Tel: 1(868) 220-6253 Ext. 4124/4125 Email: malfminister@gov.tt

Comments of the Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries on the Nineteenth Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Examination of the Reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements of the Agricultural Development Bank for the financial years 2014 to 2018

The Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries (MALF) reviewed Nineteenth Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Examination of the Reports of the Auditor General on the Financial Statements of the Agricultural Development Bank (ADB) for the financial years 2014 to 2018.

The MALF provides input towards the recommendations proposed to improve the operations of the ADB as follows:

1. Outstanding Audited Financial Statements

Recon	nmendation	Comm	nent of the MALF
(i.)	The ADB should provide to Parliament the status of the outstanding audited financial statements for financial years 2020-2023 by January 14, 2025	(i.)	The MALF agrees that timely reporting on financial statements is a priority. The MALF was informed by the ADB that the audit of the financial statements for 2020 was completed by the Auditor General's Department (AGD). The draft financial statements for 2021 and 2022 were adjusted and resubmitted to the AGD on October 2, 2024, due to the adjustment of the asset valuation for 2018. The draft financial statements for 2023 and 2024 were completed but adjustments were necessary as the AGD required the inclusion of International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS) 16. The expected completion date is January 22, 2025, for submission to the Finance Committee.
(ii.)	The MALF in collaboration with the ADB should propose amendments to the Agricultural Development Bank Act Chap. 79:07 to include a provision relating to the	(ii.)	The MALF noted the recommendation. However, due to international and regional trade issues, amendments on other legislation took precedence, namely the Fisheries Management Bill and the Beekeeping and Bee Products Act. The MALF will write to the

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
timeframe in which financial statements are to be submitted to the AGD and provide an update to Parliament by January 14, 2025.	Board of the ADB to consider legislative amendments to include a timeframe for submission of financial statements.

2. Status on Government Subvention

Recommendation		Comment of the MALF
(i.)	The MALF should briefly	(i.) The subvention of the ADB is under
	provide to the Parliament	the purview of the Ministry of
	by January 14, 2025, a	Finance MoF.
	rationale as to how the	
	approved level of	
	subvention is determined	
	and what avenues can be	
	pursued to better align	
	requests to meet the	
	ADB's desired outcome.	

3. Outdated Legislation

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
(i.) The MALF should	(i.) The MALF previously received
provide an update to	recommendations of amendments to
Parliament in the status of	the ADB Act in 2014 and 2018 from
the finalization of the	the Board of the ADB. Given the
proposed amendments to	reprioritization of the legislative
the ADB Act and briefly	agenda of the MALF, there have been
describe the anticipated	no amendments to the ADB Act. To
benefits of the draft	address this, the MALF will forward
amendments for the	the previously proposed
greater fulfilment of the	recommendations to the current
Bank's mandate by	Board of the ADB for consideration.
January 14, 2025.	

4. The Lack of an established Pension Scheme

Reco	mmendation	Comment of the MALF
(i.)	The ADB should provide	(i.) The MALF was informed that the
	a status update to	establishment of a Pension Scheme
	Parliament on the	was presented to the Board of
	decision reached by the	Directors (BOD) of the ADB in 2024.
	Board for an approved	

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
pension scheme and	a. Finalization of the Terms of
indicate the way forward	Reference for the recruitment
to ensure implementation	of a consultant;
of the approved scheme,	b. Hiring of a consultant to
expected by the end of	undertake a review of
FY2025, by January 14,	appropriate pension schemes;
2025.	c. Acquisition of proposals from
	providers based on the current
	needs of the ADB; and
	d. Evaluation and
	recommendation will be
	made to the Board of
	Directors for a decision
	forward.

5. The Absence of a Mobile App

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
(i.) The ADB should provide a status update to Parliament on the development of a mobile app by January 14, 2025; and	(i.) The MALF concurs that the development of a mobile app would be useful in the operations of the ADB. The BOD agreed to upgrade the Information Technology (IT) infrastructure and other urgent requirements for the implementation of a mobile app. The MALF was advised by the ADB that a consultant would be engaged to review and provide strategic recommendations on the requisite IT infrastructure, systems, network, servers, cybersecurity, and related processes. The IT consultant will also assist in upgrading critical IT components such as the network, hardware, operating system, processes, and core banking software. Additionally, the consultant will be a part of the ADB's IT Steering Committee to guide the strategic direction of IT initiatives.
(ii.) The ADB should provide an update on the timeline for the rollout of the Core Banking System by January 14, 2025.	(ii.) The timeline for the rollout of the Core Banking System would be determined subsequent to the upgraded IT infrastructure of the ADB.

6. Levels of Debtor Delinquency

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
Recommendation (i.) The ADB should report to Parliament in whether there are any international best practices followed by counterpart institutions in other jurisdictions which the Bank could adopt in treating with this issue of	(i.) The ADB has advised that the Small Enterprise Evaluation Project (SEEP) Model is widely used for agricultural developmental financial institutions to address debtor delinquency.
treating with this issue of debtor delinquency by January 14, 2025.	

7. Market Growth Rate

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
(i.) The ADB should provide to Parliament a brief report on the formulation of the Strategic Plan for the period 2026-2028 specifically noting the strategic objectives which may be included in the area of market expansion, as well as the expected timeline for the development of the Plan by January 14, 2025.	(i.) The BOD of the ADB agreed to the engagement of a consultant to facilitate the development of the ADB's Strategic Plan for 2025-2027 and to provide Leadership and Management Training for the Executive Management Team. The ADB has proposed to engage Deloitte & Touche to provide consultancy services to facilitate the development of the Strategic Plan 2025-2027 and to provide leadership and management training in January 2025.
(ii.) The ADB should advocate to the MALF on the necessity for the Bank to facilitate foreign exchange and provide an update on this discussion to Parliament by January 14, 2025.	(ii.) The ADB agrees to the recommendation and will engage the MALF and MoF following the adoption of the Strategic Plan 2025-2027.

8. Youth engagement

Recommendation

(i.) The ADB should consult the **FAO** publication Youth and Agriculture: Key Challenges Concrete Solutions and report to the Parliament by January 14, 2025 on the extent to which the Bank may be able to incorporate some of the advice contained therein into its own youth-related initiatives.

Comment of the MALF

Opportunities to incorporate and (i.) further explore some of the advice outlined in the FAO publication will continue to be in focus. It should be noted that many of the options outlined to enhance access to services financial have been incorporated in the Bank's developmental agri-finance business model and past youth initiatives with mixed success. These include inter alia, providing access to low cost funding through specific youth focussed programmes leveraging international donor funding and features such as technical support (e.g. EU -funded ADB Youth Window Program); the leveraging of loan guarantees to lower the risk of lending (e.g. from the now defunct state entity Small **Business** Development Company (SBDC)); crafting of collaborative packages incorporating marketing support through sister state agencies; pursuing collaborations for training courses on financial literacy (e.g. through the Central Bank Financial Literacy Programme); as well as ongoing initiatives to conduct such capacity building within the remit of the Bank which are subject to resource availability.

Recommendation

- Comment of the MALF
- (ii.) The ADB should report to Parliament on the following by January 14, 2025:
 - a. Work done to date in collaboration with the MYDNS as part of the Youth Aquaculture Project and/or the Youth Agricultural Shade House Project, or ways in which the ADB could pursue such collaboration.
- (ii.) The ADB through its Business Development Department engaged with the MYDNS from the inception of its youth focused programmes in 2021, with the launch of its Youth Agricultural Shade House Project (YAHP) and has continued to date with the successive introduction of the Youth Agricultural Shade House Project (YSP) and the Youth Aquaculture Project (YAQ). Opportunities have been pursued as part of the Bank's work plans to pro-actively enhance the Bank's portfolio growth from the youth demographic and support food security contributions from agri -MSME's, through the following actions:

1. Establishment of Strategic alliances –

- To drive growth and sustainability youth from the demographic, the institutional knowledge of ADB was leveraged through membership on the YAHP -Programme Coordinating Committee (PCC). Contributions to inform policy, programme implementation/ monitoring and ultimately development of market channels for agri-finance have been made. Contributions were also made at the recent Extension Services Forum of the Youth Agricultural Homestead Programme (YAHP) held to support Cohort 1 graduates.
- b) The Bank strengthened its engagement with the Youth Aquaculture Programme (YAQ), through membership on the recently formed YAQ Management Committee, positioning itself as a

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
	future partner to support aquaculture
	development.
	2. Marketing Outreach and
	New Business Channels
	a) The Bank initiated an on-
	going outreach collaboration with
	MYDNS through ADB's Mobile
	Banking Unit (MBU) and other face
	to face outreach presentations to
	enable financial access to participants
	in the three (3) pilot programmes.
	Presentations by the Cooperatives
	Division to YSP were also attended
	as part of seeking collaborative
	approaches as the programmes
	evolve and are rolled out.
	b) The Bank facilitated Savings Account Drives and promoting
	Account Drives and promoting financial inclusion to cohorts.
	c) The Bank's digital social
	media engagement included a feature
	on the recently launched 'Quan's
	Farm Podcast,' hosted by ADB youth
	entrepreneur and YAHP graduate Mr.
	la Quan Pearie to also engage the
	youth demographics.
	3. Product Development
	The Bank's current loan offerings are
	well placed to meet a range of project
	needs through inter alia its flagship
	New Reality Loan that flexes to meet
	the needs of any type and size of
	activity or agri-entrepreneur; the
	ADB Boost an unsecured facility
	offered as ADB's pro-active response
	to aid food producers and
	entrepreneurs who have limited
	options for securing finance for Agri-
	investment and the ADB Secure
	tailored to assist agri-businesses with
	praedial larceny and other personal security solutions (modern
	surveillance, monitoring, alarms,
	perimeter fencing & personal / family
	security etc.).

9. Human Resources

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
(i.) The ADB should provide	(i.) The status updates are as follows:
to the Parliament by	a. The ADB is in the process of
January 14, 2025 the	developing the job
following:	descriptions for two (2)
a. Increasing the	additional positions in the
staffing	Audit Department. Once
component of the	completed, consultation
Internal Audit	discussions will be held with
Unit through	the Public Services
short-term	Association (PSA), in
contracts with the	accordance with the
assistance of the	subsisting Collective
MALF;	Agreement. Thereafter, the
b. Provide an update	recruitment and selection
on the recruitment	process will commence. The
of the personnel	ADB will seek to expedite
based on its	this process to ensure that the
prioritised list of	Audit Department meets its
vacancies;	objectives;
c. Provide an update	b. On November 14, 2024, the
on the outcome of	MALF provided a letter of
the planned	non-objection to fill ten (10)
manpower audit	positions based on the
and if it has not	prioritised list of vacancies. It
been initiated,	is expected that the process to
provide an	fill those positions will be
expected timeline	completed by March 31st,
for its	2025; c. The ADB commenced a
completion; and d. Report on the	
d. Report on the outcome of its	process to undertake a
CED COST CHECK CONTRACT CONTRA	manpower audit in 2019 to inform of any realignment of
request to the MALF for the	its organizational structure to
provision of	ensure that it is fit for
personnel to fulfil	purpose. Upon the review of
existing posts on a	tenders received, approval
short term basis.	was obtained to select a
Short term ousis.	provider. However, this
	process was halted due to the
	restrictions of the COVID-19
	Pandemic. In June 2023, the
	Bank considered its position
	to re-engage the MALF
	regarding the process.

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
	Documents were submitted to the MALF to restart the manpower audit process. The MALF is in the process of reviewing the document and will provide feedback by the end of February 2025; and d. The ADB is currently undergoing the process of recruiting temporary Loans Officer and the interview process will commence on January 14, 2025.
(ii.) The ADB should Parliament with a status update of the outcome of the investigation of the four staff members by January 14, 2025.	(ii.) This matter is now before the Industrial Court.

10. Selection of Legal Service Providers

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
(i.) The ADB should provide a status update to Parliament on the development of guidelines for the selection of legal service providers outside of its approved panel of attorneys, by January 14, 2025.	(ii.) Subsequent to the appointment BOD, the position of the Corporate Secretary was filled and the process of reviewing panel has been initiated and will be completed in the next quarter.

11. Risk Management

Recommendation		Comn	nent of the MALF
(i.)	The ADB should provide	(i.)	The ADB is actively seeking to fill
	a status update on its		the position of Corporate Manager-
	efforts to recruit a		Risk and Compliance. This Executive
	Corporate Manager -		Management position was advertised
	Risk and Compliance to		on three (3) occasions within the past
	Parliament, by January		year and a series of interviews were
	14, 2025.		conducted. The most suitable and

Recommendation	Comment of the MALF
	only successful candidate declined the Bank's offer, as there was no flexibility to negotiate a higher compensation package which is determined by the Office of the Chief Personnel Officer. The Bank is experiencing difficulties in attracting suitably experienced and qualified candidates for this position as the current remuneration is at 2014's salary rate. The ADB has a shortlist of applicants and will continue to expedite the process to fill the vacancy as soon as possible.
(ii.) The ADB should provide a status update on the outcome of the Policy Review and Board approval of the Risk and compliance Policy to Parliament by January 14, 2025.	(ii.) Risk and Compliance Policy and Procedures are in place at the ADB and was approved on June 27, 2018 by the BOD. Further, the ADB reviewed the Anti Money Laundering/ Counter Financing of Terrorism (AML/CFT) Manual in November 2024 and conducted AML/CFT Training for all permanent staff and members of the BOD over the period: • Staff – November 13th 2024 & November 20th 2024; • Management & Compliance Staff – October 15th 2024; and • Board of Directors – September 25th 2024.

Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries January 13, 2025